

The Experience of Movement Meditation: A Dance of Rhythmic Paradox and Time

Judith A. Cohen, PhD, RN, Cheryl Laskowski, PhD, RN, and Betty A. Rambur, PhD, RN

University of Vermont

College of Nursing and Health Sciences

Abstract

There has been a growing interest in non-Western approaches to attention, consciousness, health, and healing. One largely unexplored tradition stems from the teachings of Gurdjieff, which focus on movement meditation. The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore the experience of movement meditation as a first step toward determining potential for health and healing. Phenomenology was selected to explore the experience of movement meditation. The essential structure of the experience of movement meditation reflected three elements: (a) an in-the-moment experience of movement meditation, (b) outcomes of movement meditation, and (c) metathemes that surround the whole experience of movement meditation.

Key Words: Health, healing, meditation, complementary medicine, alternative medicine, consciousness

Introduction

Caring has been defined as the essence and moral ideal of nursing (Leininger, 1991; Watson, 1988). Over the past 40 years, the concept of caring has taken center stage in nursing research and practice to explicate the meaning of this highly valued domain of nursing (Benner & Wrubel, 1989; Gaut, 1988; Leininger, 1988; Ray, 1988; Watson, 1988). Caring knowledge is what defines the nursing perspective and it is the centrality of caring in the human health experience, which has been recognized as the focus of the nursing discipline (Newman, Sime, & Corcoran-Perry, 1991). The paradigmatic shifts in nursing perspectives have changed how the discipline views human beings, health, and healing (Fawcett, 2000; Newman, 1992; Parse, 1998). Health is no longer viewed as the absence of disease but as expanding consciousness within human beings, which is revealed in their evolving patterns and is characterized by meaning (Newman, 2008).

Parallel to the shift in nursing perspec-

tives has been a marked and growing interest in non-Western approaches to attention, consciousness, health, and healing. Although often termed “complementary” or “alternative,” many of these approaches have a much longer lineage than empirical Western medicine based on reductionistic paradigms. Buddhism is a notable example, and despite its complexity, multiplicity of systems (Mahayana, Hinayana, & Vajrayana), and distinct schools within each system, secular, Westernized, health-related applications have become nearly mainstream. “Mindfulness meditation” for stress reduction, as promulgated by advocate Jon Kabat-Zinn (1994), is just one such example.

Recent advances in neuroimaging have been coupled with new understandings of neuroplasticity. Neuroplasticity has been identified as the potential for repeated experience to foster new neuronal growth and connections, which in turn enables emergence of latent intellectual, emotional, or physical possibilities. Such new knowledge suggests that ancient teachings and techniques have endured and evolved over 2,500 years because they offer genuine and unique effects to contemporary society. Investigation of the effects of meditation,

for example, suggest definitive neurophysiologic (Cahn & Polich, 2006) and immune function impacts (Davidson et al., 2003). Similarly, a comprehensive review of 47 research studies on Tai Chi finds evidence of physiological and psychological benefits, despite methodological challenges (Wang, Collett, & Lau, 2004).

One novel and heretofore largely unexplored tradition stems from the teachings of G.I. Gurdjieff, as elucidated by his student and proponent J.G. Bennett. Unique methods of attention development include active guided sitting meditation, historically referenced as “Morning Exercises” because they are done every morning, and complex, precise movement patterns accompanied by corresponding music. The movement patterns, colloquially called “Sacred Dance,” “Sacred Gymnastics,” or, most commonly, simply “The Movements,” are the focus of this study. Specifically, the purpose of this qualitative study was to explore the lived experience of movement meditation, as a first step toward determining utility and potential transferability to health and healing.

Background

Contemporary scientific literature has given scant attention to Gurdjieff’s work or philosophy; only two references were found in the peer-reviewed health and medical literature. Goleman (1988) reported that when compared to other forms of meditation, Gurdjieff meditators showed greater cortical specificity—the ability to activate areas of the brain necessary to the task at hand while leaving irrelevant areas of the brain inactive. Potentially, these findings suggest applicability in maladies

that range from attention-deficit disorder to obsessive-compulsive disorder. Stanton (1997) used a Gurdjieff technique of “two-fold awareness” in an interventional study of 24 female homemakers who wished to gain more control over their lives. When compared to the control group, the treatment group scored significantly higher on the Control of Life Thermometer, both immediately after treatment and at 6 months follow-up.

Research studies specifically exploring Gurdjieff Movements were not identified. Documented in print, however, are personal accounts of first, second, and third generation students of Gurdjieff. Many of these texts are not particularly accessible through traditional literature reviews but instead may be found at booksellers specializing in Gurdjieff and his lineage, for example, Bennett Books (www.bennettbooks.org) and By The Way Books (www.bythewaybooks.com). All accounts clarify the essential, compelling, and unique aspects of the accompanying music and imply that the music does not merely accompany the movements or the movements the music. Rather, together these dances are part of a single process designed to address Gurdjieff’s “fundamental concern” about the human condition, the “imbalance of the three parts of our psyche, which he terms “the intellectual, emotional, and instinctive or moving life of man (sic)” (Daniel-Spitz, 2007, p. 106). Indeed, this tradition is sometimes called “The Fourth Way” because it combines the use of the body (the Fakir path), the heart (the Monk path) and the mind (the Yogi path, inclusive of modern “mindfulness” meditation) and theoretically enables far more rapid personal and emotional growth than any of these paths pursued in isolation (Ouspenski, 1949). Moreover, the Gurdjieff is “emphatic that the settings of family, work, and the marketplace are the best context for inner discipline, providing the raw material for meditation” (Goleman, 1988, p. 103).

Relationship of the Researchers to This Tradition

Two of the researchers conducting this study had no previous connections of any kind to the Gurdjieff tradition but participated because of their experience as qualitative researchers. These researchers were responsible for the coding of themes. The third author is a long-time student of Fourth Way teachings. Her interest in empirical research using study methods accepted to Western science emerged from her personal experience of The Movements and fellow students’ reports of positive life-effects, both physical and emotional.

Methodology

The qualitative method of phenomenology was selected to explore, describe, and understand the lived experience of movement meditation. While there are a number of different interpretations of the phenomenological method, Spiegelburg (1982) identified the characteristics of the method common to all interpretations. This general framework involves three steps: (a) obtaining a naïve description from informants about their experiences of the phenomenon, (b) investigating general essences and apprehending essential relationships among essences, and (c) phenomenological description.

The first step in obtaining a naïve account of the lived experience was to intuit the phenomenon (Oiler, 1986). It involved exploring both the perception of the experience of movement meditation before reflection or interpretation and then the reflective thoughts about how the experience was lived. In order to enter and accurately portray another’s reality, bracketing, or the setting aside of the researcher’s assumptions and knowledge about movement meditation was necessary.

The second step in the method is phenomenological reflection or analysis, identifying the structure of the phenomenon

according to the elements and their configuration (Oiler, 1986). This involved free imaginative variation or viewing the phenomenon in all possible ways that it can appear in lived experience in order to identify the constituent elements of the phenomenon: how they related to each other and other phenomena, what patterns or general essences existed, and what essential essences could be discovered.

The third step of the phenomenological method is the description that expresses all the awarenesses that have emerged through reflection and analysis. Reflection upon the particular experience of movement meditation of each participant and comparison of this unique experience and its structures with the unique lived experiences of other participants was important because it was assumed that each unique meaning would contribute in its own way to an even fuller understanding of movement meditation.

Following approval by the Institutional Review Board (IRB), which included translation into Italian and back translation by a different translator, data were gathered in Northeast Italy during a 10-day intensive seminar. Participants in this residential retreat were primarily Italian with a small complement of German, Austrian, and British students. A small purposive group of five participants (three women, two men) were interviewed to evolve a rich, “thick” description of the lived experience of movement meditation. Informed consent was obtained and each participant was assigned a code number. Names were not recorded anywhere except on the consent form. Participants were advised that although the research may be published, all data associated with the research would remain confidential.

Data collection was performed in a place of the participant’s choosing. Consistent with phenomenology, no structured interview protocols were used to guide data collection. One central question was explored, “Tell me about your experience with the

Gurdjieff/Bennett Movements.” Other questions to probe for the deeper meaning of the movement meditation experience were asked through a method of “talk turning” (Ray, 1988) or taking cues from a previous answer for subsequent questions. The translator, a professional translator who was fluent in multiple languages, was also a student of the teachings of the Gurdjieff tradition. All interviews were conducted in the native language of the subject and, for this study, was limited to Italian and British students.

Saturation was achieved when all that could be understood about the experience was obtained. Saturation required one to two interviews of approximately 1 hour for each participant. Tape recording was utilized to facilitate data collection. All of the taped interviews were transcribed. After data collection and transcription of the data, the transcripts were read, developing a sense of the whole and extracting significant statements about the experience of movement meditation, marking the transcription whenever transitions of meaning were perceived. The data were reduced, organized into clusters or themes, and then examined for overlapping data. Finally the themes were integrated into an exhaustive description of the experience of movement meditation, reflecting the fundamental structure and meaning of the experience of movement meditation.

Essential Structure of the Experience of Movement Meditation

The essential structure of the lived experience of movement meditation reflected three fundamental elements: (a) an in-the-moment experience of movement meditation, (b) outcomes of movement meditation, and (c) metathemes which surround the whole experience of movement meditation.

In the Moment Experience of Movement Meditation

Isolation of significant thematic statements from interviews led to the formula-

tion of four essential themes that described the in-the-moment experience of movement meditation. These themes were: (a) existential calm, (b) clarity of perception/vision, (c) embodying, and (d) sensing/feeling.

Existential calm. The theme of existential calm was characterized by the participants as a calmness that came over them, a releasing of energy, or a letting go. This calm was exemplified in the rhythmic movement that occurred in the movement meditation and allowed them to be fully present in the experience. As one participant described:

Everything that I was seeing suddenly became more alive. I was looking at the trees and my gaze was completely relaxed. I remember that I was very relaxed but very clear. In the last seminar, doing a movement—what happened was that I was a lot more relaxed and it was like a shift from one day to the next. I could define it as letting go because the previous day I was very worried.

Another participant described:

I have always been kind of tense, overexcited kind of person. Now, it is not like this anymore. Something has changed. And, I can enter relaxation state very quickly. I just need to remember... Another thing that has changed is that to be able to be in a present moment.

Another participant commented on initial resistance to the movement meditation and then the acceptance and calm that movement meditation ultimately facilitated:

During a seminar, because we had to present movements, and at the certain movement, I had this blues, this thing that was kicked up and wanting to surface. He [the instructor] told me, “If you feel like doing it you do it, otherwise you don’t.” And I relaxed a lot, I was really calm when the moment came. I felt very joined with the group, even if I was not in the group, I was breathing with them...if I feel that the

other has an energy that does not allow for mine, or out of my natural alchemy that they don’t get on well, I don’t insist to meet the other, I just let things be the way they are.

Clarity of perception/vision. Participants described a clarity of perception or vision that occurred during the experience of movement meditation. This clarity of perception was also characterized as a heightened awareness.

As one participant explained:

...all around me the trees took on this very bright green shade that I had never seen. And the gaze was clear, deep and actually I am quite short sighted and this amazed me because the lenses I am wearing are not as strong as I should be wearing—that’s my choice. Quite the contrary I saw very clearly all the outlines of things...the sensation that I had was that not just all this was brighter, greener, more concrete, more real, but I also felt myself much more concrete...After that, it occurred to me that I could have called this a vision...any object, even the most trivial one, in that experience is alive and has great importance and you can see everything very clearly.

Another participant commented not only on the clarity of perception but the actual ability to visualize new potentials in the experience. Visualizing movements before they happened lead to new perceptual capabilities:

By the morning exercises, the movements help you to develop your power of visualization in movements, because you try to visualize what to do next, and how this movement works. You actually visualize something as part of the body. In the morning exercise, you are visualizing things you can do in your body...so it’s like meditation, but you are not just sitting there observing thoughts, watching, or trying to stop

thoughts...the body becomes sort of a place where you can move around. It is like a child imagining you can move things around, move things from one part of the body to another, or move energy from here to there. You can imagine the possibilities and imagine that happening. So you are visualizing this process.

The clarity and vitality of experience that happens in movement meditation is again reflected in these statements:

...it happens here after the movement and it also happened at home in other kinds of situations. What I see is a lot clearer and brighter, colors are much brighter. And objects and people are more clear...sharper. It is this third dimension world exhausted...intensified. This can last five minutes, half hour. At that moment there is a very strong perception that holds within the body, not just outside.

Some described this clarity of perception and vision to include a mindfulness, a focused concentration or attention:

You do it to get some sort of direct enjoyment as well; sometimes you are very concentrated on what you are doing and what comes next, and how you have to do things.

While in the movements you realize what steps you have to take, what movements with the arms or legs you are going to take next, because everything happens in a very short period of time. You have to know what you are doing next so you are able to do it.

Embodying. A theme of embodying included a new awareness of the body/sensations by participants while experiencing movement meditation. Some described this awareness as sense awareness, some as energy awareness, and some as body awareness:

The first time I didn't have any particular experience with regard to the move-

ment. But I felt it was very good for my body. Habits I had in my body. I felt my body was being fuller. It is simply being very present in all the parts of the body, in what might be all the parts of the body. You can also distinguish differences between one part and another one. Surely the biggest one is the one between the sensations one can experience in the limbs. It should bring your attention there and they become ever stronger and you even get to sensing the bones. And then there is another one which is very strong, which is in the center of the chest which is surely of a different kind because it is more flowing. And it is connected to the breath, and this can also be deepened, even as I am talking.

Another participant commented:

After a while of doing this, always with my eyes being very relaxed, I started feeling, especially in the limbs, and then in the whole body rigors of sensations and the positions were happening on their own. Of course, I was not perfect but if the positions were in a certain way and that's where my limbs were going the sensations were just like a river as if they were saying it's fine and I had to do very, very little for it to happen – just being careful, aware, remembering the sequence and the rest was with the music and with these sensations in the body, which I cannot describe other than as a river. After these exercises some sensation, especially seeing and tasting food were much stronger. I think it makes you a little bit more aware, perhaps. In general a little bit more aware, and with movements you become much more aware of your body, space, and time.

Another participant described this increased awareness as a wholeness of experience:

It is an attention that also involves feeling as well as hearing, sight, the senses,

all the senses. At certain times listening with the whole body and therefore being able to perceive, understand something that goes beyond what is manifesting in the world.

Some of the increased sensations described by the participants were a warmth, burning, or pressure in the chest:

And then these things kept on happening all the time—questions, answers all through doing the movement, like many suggestions coming as sensations in the body, as...and also emotions that I feel as a sensation in the chest which I can't name as a kind of pressure here in the chest but I can't say it is anger, it is joy. Simply sensations there that are not connected with somebody offending me and then I am upset. I feel something strongly but nobody has said anything.

When we do the exercise of feeling the exchange of substances, there remains a sensation underneath the sternum...And I don't really know how to describe the sensation, but I know that I can communicate with this part, this thing that I feel here with other parts of the body...as if something is burning, an internal burn...not on the surface.

This also happens as a sensation in the rest of the body.

Others describe this same energy, warmth, and tingling within other areas of the body:

Something happened to my head. It is kind of a little tingling. Some light starts, which allows me to see a different way. I can see more lights...I can really sense there is different tone in my eyes. There is more light; everything is lighter.

During the exercises, the experiences are different. There can be a moment in which we experience the whole body as very lively, and there is an impression of expansion, as this body is a lot bigger than the physical

body. And I bring my attention to a certain point... Those parts also become more alive, bigger. Symmetry of a lot of warmth raises in the whole body. It expands and experiences of inner tingling.

Sensing/feeling. The in-the-moment experience of movement meditation included an affective or emotional component, that of heightened sensing/feeling. Some of the emotions included joy, melancholy, feeling strongly or deeply, hope, awe, and calm. Participants described these feelings, "...and that pressure in the chest... I mean it can be any kind of emotion. I can't give it a name. I can't say happy, offended, upset. Simply the thing happened." "Two days ago for the first time when we did this exercise of visualizing parts of the body and putting them in a place outside of our body... I really felt that something was really entering... and joyous." "You do it to get some sort of direct enjoyment... there is a mixture of different feelings, I think. Sometimes it is melancholic feeling or feelings of hope or mystery... And often, quite deep feelings." "After doing these exercises, what was born in me was convictions that it is possible to learn, really, how to live. And, it has to do with confidence, cultivating oneself, doing exercise, because you are more centered."

Outcomes of Movement Meditation

Three essential themes were identified by participants as reflecting outcomes of movement meditation. These included: (a) transcending, (b) enlightening, and (c) transforming and/or recreating experience.

Transcending. Some of the participants described one of the outcomes of movement meditation as an experience that transcends the self or is experienced outside the self. It was characterized by connection to those around them as well as an increased sense of spiritual connection outside of themselves. Descriptions included, "I had the ex-

perience that the movement that I am doing is not mine. It belongs to the group." "That was another exercise that had a very powerful effect on me... and I am very connected to and balanced to God." "Other exercises for instance, the nine point exercise... I feel as if boundaries of the body are no longer there... these boundaries are not real." And: "Something opens up here... in the chest. It is like if I entered something that contains me, it is bigger than me. It contains me. I am connected, yet it's bigger, and the ego can go away there. It's a little bit like when the heart opens up."

Enlightening. While participants did describe transcendence beyond themselves, they also described a sense of enlightening, a personal discovery, and an increased reflectivity/self awareness of who they were as individuals. Some of the distance that was created by the experience in moving beyond self paradoxically allowed them to increase focus, explore, and understand self, to gain self-mastery:

When I do the moving, it leaves me with an energy... I would like to use this energy better, and bring it ever deeper. I would like to get to renew my life energy now. I have a group of friends... which I hope will get wider and wider... It is a reality to be completely discovered... for me this was simply enlightening.

When I try to do some movement that at first seems difficult or impossible or something... Yeah, it is like a play, a body that becomes a place, in which you can sort of travel around. You can go all kind of places. Inside your head, and down from inside your head through your throat, through your heart, and anyway you want. Maybe it puts you more in contact with your emotions as well. Basic emotions like love or hope... actually helps me in everyday life... through the morning ex-

ercise being able to get in touch with these emotions which in different situations they can be useful.

I no longer have a sudden burst of anger or hysterical kind of reaction with my daughter, with people, family usually. Because there is a distance that allows me to observe what is happening between myself and my daughter. And it is a relationship that occurs in a space and by being within I can also be outside. This has clearly been happening only since I started doing these exercises and this work. It's not the distance between me and her. It is a distance between me and the outside. I was able to see what was happening and this allowed me not to react. It somehow leads you not to judge what is happening; just feel it.

Transforming and/or recreating experience.

The final outcome of the movement meditation experience by participants was a transformation that occurred in them and an ability to recreate the experience and its transformative qualities at a later point in time:

I continued doing the exercises we had been doing that morning and my particular exercise, the one that had been assigned to me. And a few days later it came back, I had this experience two or three times. Especially the second and the third time that I was trying to keep and maintain the sensation in the body, it lasted longer. And this happened to me within the seminar center and what particularly struck me was that any object, even the most trivial in that experience, is alive and has great importance and you can see everything very clearly.

"Now there are moments without him reminding me, even if they are short, in which I feel that I can go back to that body of sensation."

Some of the transformation occurred as a

result of a different perceptual awareness, as described by this participant:

There are moments in which I might be walking down the street, visiting a friend, and it is like I was there for the first time every time. There are times...it happens here after the movement, and it also happened at home in other kinds of situations, in which I am there, but I am not in that place. It is a different world, a different dimension. What I see is clear and brighter, colors are much brighter and objects and people are more clear.

Other signs of transformation were a greater understanding and perhaps intuitive awareness in approaching experience and its meaning:

Maybe what has changed is also priorities in choosing things, but not just that, but also a way of living time in a different way....Right then, I can feel, understand situations in much more complete and deeper ways...any situation, family or work situation. Since I started this work with movement and exercises...see the whole person, at certain times, listening with the whole body and therefore being able to perceive, understand something which goes beyond what is manifesting in the work.

Finally, this transformation included a greater harmony within oneself, a greater centeredness and new found confidence and courage:

I realized that I was not holding rhythm...In the afternoon...he told us, "Dance as you like." Then I was very, very lost. I like dancing freely and I was holding rhythm very well....There was a rhythm I held for awhile that I no longer believed in. I was no longer held in the rhythm...it was also what was happening in my life. And to support me he said, "That's what you have done freely, you are holding rhythm in your life" and then another thing happened. These exercises gave me the

trust that I was able to be stronger. To be more centered, to feel more, to have more trust, more confidence...it was possible to learn to live. It was a tool that gave possibilities to see things in different ways, to have resources to deal with life and to face life. After doing these exercises, what was born in me was convictions that it is possible to learn, really, how to live. It has to do with confidence, cultivating oneself, doing exercises, because you are more centered.

Starting from that movement, I am starting to feel responsible for my children. I am changing my job, I am doing training to do work I like to do. My courage has increased – courage, trust, love. The courage I am trying to reach what I want, to pursue what I really want...It was a big, big thing for me. Changed my outlook. My life has changed. The outlook has become an outlook of possibility. If I work for what I want, if I devote myself for something I can do things, I can reach what I want...because change is always telling me that I am very strong.

Metathemes

There were two metathemes that represented an environmental phenomenon surrounding the whole experience of movement meditation. These themes are separately described because they were not a component of the in-the-moment experience or outcomes of movement meditation, rather they are imbedded within all. These metathemes are: (a) a change in time perception and (b) rhythmic paradoxes.

Change in time perception. Participants clearly described the experience of movement meditation as leading to a different awareness or perception of time; a lengthening of time. With this lengthening perception of time came a greater ability to be fully present in the moment, which also seemed to enhance the individual's aware-

ness:

This has allowed me, during the movements, to have more time...it is as if, in some movements, time is lengthened...and I have more time to be aware of the sensation or aware of where the other people in the group are going and therefore I can follow that. I can be more aware of the music. I can divide my attention on one or two things...In some moments it's as if one had more time to decide what to do next. I can even decide to waste it in thinking.

There are two parts that are starting to have a space, a longer space in my time. Longer length of time. What I feel here in the chest, in the brain, in the body is similar. The lengthening of time seems to yield an increased sense of accomplishment yet relaxation and calm; a decreased amount of anxiety.

I can tell you with inner exercise, the changes that have come in my everyday life. First of all, I have noticed a change in my perceptual time. That is, a lot more time can be used in the day. There is time to do everything and there are no longer urgencies or an urgency message. Another thing that has changed is that of being able to be in a present moment and this changes the quality of my life. It used to be very common thing to spend time thinking what should I do? What will I become? This no longer happens. Maybe it is also a part of perceiving time in a different way.

Rhythmic paradoxes. The second metatheme that surrounded the experience of movement meditation was rhythmic paradoxes. Some paradoxes identified included focused attention of movement meditation while letting go, presence or in-the-moment experience while distancing or disassociation from the moment to be able to reflect on the experience, embodying or increased awareness of the body and sensations while

experiencing out of body perception, and doing the same movement yet experiencing it differently or recreating the experience at another time.

I had to do very little for it to happen—just being careful, aware, remembering the sequence and the rest was with the music and with these sensations in the body which I cannot describe other than as a river. And after that in all the movements, especially the ones where I let go with the weight, this happens all the time ever stronger.

There are times it happens here after the movement, and it also happened at home in other kinds of situations in which I am there, but I am not in that place. It is a different world, a different dimension.

Discussion

Complementary and Alternative Modalities (CAM) are increasingly being recognized by healthcare providers as essential components of healthcare. Of course, generations of individuals have used CAM treatments long before the biomedical model came into play or before the prevailing understanding of health and healing within the discipline of nursing. Outcome studies on CAM are now providing an evidence base for the use of these techniques (Wonderling, Vickers, Grieve, & McCarney, 2004). This research study sought to explore the experience of the Gurdjieff technique of movement meditation to identify its relevancy for, and congruency with, health and healing within nursing practice. Many of the themes reflected in the research are supported by the mindfulness literature as well as the current nursing theoretical perspectives on the role of patterns, consciousness, health and healing, and aesthetic expression in human experience.

Mindfulness

There is a growing trend to recognize the

importance of mindfulness as part of an integrated treatment modality. Mindfulness has been described as having three components: intention, attention, and attitude (Shapiro, Carlson, Astin, & Freedman, 2006). Intention is the reason for the practice. While this research study did not identify the reason why individuals chose to become involved in this modality, attention, the practice of observing experience in the moment, was evident in the research findings. Participants described their ability to attend more fully to sensory experiences. Attitude, identified by Bishop et al. (2004) as including curiosity, acceptance, and non-striving, was also evident in the experiences of our study participants.

In their theory on the mechanisms of mindfulness, Shapiro et al. proposed a model of “reperceiving” as the meta-mechanism underlying mindfulness. These authors described reperceiving as a shift in perspective. One benefit of reperceiving is that it facilitates a more flexible response to the environment. A shifting perspective was clearly evident in the descriptions of our study participants.

In an early study done to identify the impact of advanced transcendental meditation (TM) on auditory thresholds, sense of hearing in the TM practitioners was found to be enhanced (Clements & Milstein, 1977). An increased sensitivity to and clarity of perception was also described by our study participants.

The Yogic tradition from which TM emerged recognizes meditation as a process involving expansion of both inner awareness and transcendental consciousness. The research findings found that the study participants experienced a dialectic process where paradoxes, such as embodying and transcendence, seemed to have occurred simultaneously.

Support for Caring Knowledge in Nursing

The themes found in this study provide support to the nursing theoretical perspec-

tives on the role of patterns, consciousness, and aesthetic expression in health and healing. The concepts of timelessness and boundarylessness found in Newman's (1995) description of the evolution of consciousness were clearly evident in the descriptions of altered time perception and the transcendence beyond self that occurred in the experience of movement meditation. The experience in moving beyond self paradoxically allowed the participants to have a heightened sense of reflectivity and self-awareness, to increase focus to be fully present, and to explore and understand self and the meaning of patterns within their own lives. The transformation that occurred as an outcome of the movement meditation experience reflects Newman's (2008) concept of higher consciousness, which includes both order and disorder, disruption and disharmony, as well as calmness and harmony. This transformation was exhibited in not only a greater self-understanding and new found courage and confidence but a greater understanding and intuitive awareness of approaching experience, patterns, and their meaning.

The paradoxical rhythmic patterns found in the experience of movement meditation provided support for Parse's (1998) principle of cocreation of rhythmical patterns, which occurs in human experience such as revealing-concealing, enabling-limiting, and connecting-separating. The paradoxes found in the findings included focused attention while letting go, presence or in-the-moment experience while distancing or disassociation from the moment to be able to reflect on the experience, and embodying or increased awareness of the body and sensations while experiencing out of body experiences. Finally the outcomes of movement meditation were transcending, enlightening, and transforming, which were all central concepts within Parse's theory.

Finally, the findings of this study support Picard's exploration (2005) of how creative movement and dance as a mode of aesthetic

expression can enhance the rhythm of relating to self and others and heightens the capacity for restoration, healing, and self-awareness. The clarity of vision/perception, perception of time, and the integration of sensing/feeling, moving, and focused attention found in movement meditation were also reflected in Picard's study (2000) of mid-life women.

Implications for Nursing

Movement meditation is an experience that provides opportunities for practice, education, and research in nursing. It recognizes and incorporates the multiple ways of knowing (Carper, 1978) that are so vital to the development of caring knowledge. It is an aesthetic mode of expression that invites the engagement of the whole person to become conscious of personal rhythmical patterns and meanings. This self-awareness and reflectivity may enhance the practitioner's connection in caring partnerships with self, others, and the transcendence of self, while deepening understanding and meaning of other's human experience and patterns. Movement meditation, therefore, might be performed by the practitioner alone, in concert with clients, or by clients alone as the outcomes of the experience may be beneficial for individual self-growth and understanding as well as that done in a caring partnership.

There has been a call to return nursing to the discipline's holistic roots through the expanded incorporation of CAM into the nursing curricula (Helms, 2006). Teaching movement meditation as another CAM modality within the nursing curriculum or creating opportunities for students to experience movement meditation provides future practitioners with a broader arsenal of tools and modalities to enhance reflection, self-awareness, engagement, and connection in relationship.

The scarcity of the research and literature on movement meditation and its role within nursing highlights important considerations

in both teaching CAM and incorporating CAM into nursing practice. The following questions are framed for consideration and additional research:

Does one need to fully understand the theoretical/philosophical base of a particular CAM modality, such as movement meditation, in order to benefit from that modality? Does the CAM modality need to be consistent with nursing theoretical perspectives? How is clinical efficacy determined? Does the movement to incorporate CAM into mainstream nursing education co-opt the richness and intricacy of these modalities? How might one remain truthful to this richness and intricacy? Who chooses what CAM modality and why? and How does access to resources impact access to and use of CAM and other aesthetic modes of expression? Clearly, there is a need to have much greater depth of exploration around the incorporation of movement meditation into nursing practice and education. The results of this study, however, reflects the congruency of movement meditation with nursing's unitary-transformative paradigm, its theoretical perspectives, as well as its focus on the role of aesthetic expression and knowledge in caring in the human health experience.

Summary

The paradigmatic shifts in nursing perspectives have changed how the discipline views human beings, health, and healing (Fawcett, 2000; Newman, 1992; Parse, 1998). Health is no longer viewed as the absence of disease but as expanding consciousness within human beings, which is revealed in their evolving patterns, and is characterized by meaning (Newman, 2008).

The Gurdjieff Method, conceptualized as movement meditation, would be considered a "mind-body intervention" under the framework established by the National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine (NCCAM, 2007) criteria. There was little in the peer reviewed and health

literature on this particular method. This phenomenological study sought to explore the experience of the Gurdjieff technique of movement meditation to identify its relevancy for, and congruency with, health and healing within nursing practice. Participants experienced movement meditation as existential calm, clarity of perception/vision, embodying, and sensing/feeling. Outcomes of movement meditation were transcending, enlightening, and transforming/recreating experience. Two metathemes emerged from data analysis that reflected a change in time perception and rhythmic paradoxes. Many of the themes reflected in the research are supported by the mindfulness literature as well as the current nursing theoretical perspectives on the role of patterns, consciousness, health and healing, and aesthetic expression in human experience.

Incorporation of movement meditation into nursing practice and education may enhance reflection, self-awareness, engagement, and connection in relationship for students, practitioners, and caring partnerships. Further research into movement meditation as a modality to enhance engagement, reflection, self-awareness, and expanded consciousness would provide empirical validation around the richness and possibilities that movement meditation has to offer the discipline of nursing.

References

- Benner, P., & Wrubel, J. (1989). *The primacy of caring: Stress and coping in health and illness*. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley.
- Bishop, S., Lau, M., Shapiro, S., Carlson, L., Anderson, N. Carmody, J. et al. (2004). Mindfulness: A proposed operational definition. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice, 11*, 230-241.
- Cahn, B., & Polich, J. (2006). Meditation states and traits: EEG, ERP, and neuroimaging studies. *Psychological Bulletin, 132*(2), 180-211.
- Carper, B. (1978). Fundamental patterns of

- knowing in nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 1(1), 13-23.
- Clements, G., & Milstein, S. (1977). Auditory thresholds in advanced participants in the transcendental meditation program. *Scientific Research on the Transcendental Meditation Program: Collected Papers. Vol. 1*.
- Daniel-Spitz, L. (2007). Music from the real world. *Parabola*, 32(2), 100-107.
- Davidson, R., Kabat-Zinn, J., Schumacher, J., Rosenkranz, M., Mueller, D., Santorelli, S. et al. (2003). Alterations in brain and immune function produced by mindfulness meditation. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 65(4), 564-570.
- Fawcett, J. (2000). *Analysis and evaluation of contemporary nursing knowledge: Nursing models and theories*. Philadelphia: F.A. Davis.
- Gaut, D. (1988). Conceptual analysis of caring: Research method. In M. Leininger (Ed.), *Caring: An essential human need*. (pp. 27-44). Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press.
- Goleman, D. (1988). *The meditative mind: The varieties of meditative experience*. New York: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Putnam Books.
- Helms, J. (2006). Complementary and alternative therapies: A new frontier for nursing education? *Journal of Nursing Education*, 45(3), 117-123.
- Kabat-Zinn, J. (1994). *Wherever you go, there you are: Mindfulness meditation in everyday life*. New York: Hyperion.
- Leininger, M. (1991). *Culture care diversity and universality: A theory for nursing*. New York: National League for Nursing.
- Leininger, M. (1988). *Caring: An essential human need*. Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press.
- National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine (NCCAM). (2007). What is CAM? Retrieved August 8, 2007, from <http://nccam.nih.gov/health/whatis-cam/#1>
- Newman, M.A. (2008). *Transforming presence: The difference that nursing makes*. Philadelphia: F.A. Davis.
- Newman, M.A. (1995). *A developing discipline: Selected works of Margaret Newman*. New York: National League for Nursing.
- Newman, M.A. (1992). Prevailing paradigms in nursing. *Nursing Outlook*, 40(1), 10-13, 32.
- Newman, M.A., Sime, A.M., & Corcoran-Perry, S.A. (1991). The focus of the discipline of nursing. *Advances in Nursing Science*, 14(1), 1-6.
- Oiler, C.J. (1986). Qualitative methods: Phenomenology. In P. Moccia (Ed.), *New approaches to theory development* (pp. 75-103) (Publication No. 15-1992). New York: National League for Nursing.
- Ouspenski, P. (1949). *In search of the miraculous*. New York: Hartcourt, Inc.
- Parse, R.R. (1998). *The human becoming school of thought*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Picard, C. (2005). Creative movement and reflective art: Modes of expression for participant and researcher. In C. Picard & D. Jones (Eds.), *Giving voice to what we know: Margaret Newman's theory of health as expanding consciousness in nursing practice, research, and education*. (pp. 119-132). Sudbury, MA: Jones and Bartlett.
- Picard, C. (2000). Uncovering pattern of expanding consciousness in mid-life women: Creative movement and the narrative as modes of expression. *Nursing Science Quarterly*, 13(2), 150-158.
- Ray, M. (1988). A philosophical analysis of caring within nursing. In M. Leininger (Ed.), *Caring: An essential human need*. (pp. 25-36). Detroit, MI: Wayne State University.
- Shapiro, S., Carlson, L., Astin, J. & Freedman, B. (2006). Mechanisms of mindfulness. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 62(3), 373-386.
- Spiegelburg, H. (1982). *The phenomenological movement: A historical introduction* (3rd ed). The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff.
- Stanton, H.E. (1997). Gurdjieff and ego-enhancement: a powerful alliance. *American Journal of Clinical Hypnosis*, 40(1), 376-84.
- Wang, C., Collet, J., & Lau, J. (2004). The effects of Tai Chi on health outcomes in patients with chronic conditions—A systematic review. *Archives of Internal Medicine*, 164(5), 495-501.
- Watson, J. (1988). *Nursing: Human science and human care*. New York, NY: National League for Nursing.
- Wonderling, D., Vickers, A. Grieve, R., & McCarney, R. (2004). Cost effectiveness analysis of a randomized trial of acupuncture for chronic headache in primary care. *British Medical Journal*, 328, 1-5.

Author Note

Judith A. Cohen, Professor, Cheryl Laskowski, Adjunct Assistant Professor, and Betty A. Rambur, Professor and Dean, University of Vermont, College of Nursing and Health Sciences, Burlington, Vermont.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Judith A. Cohen, 219 Rowell, Department of Nursing, College of Nursing and Health Sciences, University of Vermont, Burlington, VT 05405 USA. Electronic mail may be sent via Internet to Judith.Cohen@uvm.edu